# रक्षा लेखा महानियंत्रक

Controller General of Defence Accounts उलान बटार रोड,पालम, दिल्ली छावनी-110010 Ulan Batar Road, Palam, Delhi Cantt 110010

No. AN/XIII/13128/APAR/2010-11

Dated 29,05.2013

30

To

All Pr. Controllers/Controllers/ PCA (Fys) Kolkata/ CsFA (Fys)/ PIFAs/IFAs

SUB: Writing and maintenance of Annual Performance Assessment Report (APAR).

REF: This office confidential letter No. AN/XIII/13128/3/Vol-XI dated 14.12.90

and No. AN/XIII/13128/ACR/2009-2010 dated 05.08.2010.

Consequent upon introduction of APAR for numerical grading, the system of reporting, reviewing, accepting and consideration of representation against the entries and final grading in APAR in respect of officials up to the rank of Sr. A O level has been examined and it is proposed to revise the existing guidelines on writing and maintenance of Confidential Reports circulated vide Hqrs office confidential letter No. AN/XIII/13128/3/Vol-XI dated 14.12.90.

- 2. Based on recent circulars issued by the DOPT, it is proposed to frame following guidelines for writing and maintenance of APAR:
- I. The columns in the APAR should be filled with due care and attention and after devoting adequate time.
- II. Numerical grading are to be awarded by reporting and reviewing authorities for the quality of work output, personal attributes and functional competence of the officer reported upon. These should be on a scale of 1-10 in whole numbers, where 1 refers to the lowest grade and 10 to the highest. The accepting authority will also give overall grade on a score of 1-10.
- III. The overall grade on a score of 1-10 will be based on 40% weightage on assessment of work output, and 30% each for assessment of personal attributes and functional competency. The overall grading will be based on addition of the mean value of each group of indicators in proportion to weightage assigned.

- IV. It is expected that any grading of 1 or 2 (against work output or attributes of overall grade) would be adequately justified in the penpicture by way of specific failures and similarly, any grade of 9 or 10 would be justified with respect to specific accomplishments. In awarding a numerical grade, the reporting and reviewing authorities should rate the officer against a large population of his/her peers that may be currently working under them.
- V. APARs graded between 8 and 10 will be rated as 'outstanding' and will be given a score of 9 for the purpose of calculating average scores for empanelment/promotion.
- VI. APARs graded between 6 and short of 8 will be rated as 'very good' and will be given a score of 7.
- VII. APARs graded between 4 and short of 6 will be rated as 'good' and given a score of 5.
- VIII. APARs graded below 4 will be given a score of zero.
- IX. APARs of all officers and staff in the organisation shall be completed by 31<sup>st</sup> August of each year.

  (DOPT OM No. 21011/1/2010-Estt.A (Pt-II) dated 23.07.2009 refers)
- X. Where for period of report there is no Reporting Officer with the requisite experience to initiate the report, the Reviewing Officer himself may initiate the report as a Reporting Officer provided the Reviewing Officer has been the same for the entire period of report and he has in a position to fill the columns to be filled in by the Reporting Officer. Where a report is thus initiated, it will have to be reviewed by the officer above the Reviewing Officer.

# (DOPT OM No. 21011/8/85-Estt.(A), dated 23-9-1985 refers)

XI. It is to be ensured that wherever a level is missing, the system is rendered into 2 tier in place of 3 tier and under no circumstances it is converted into multi-tier system.

### (Para 217 of Office Manual Part - I refers)

- In general terms when a level is missing in the system, the immediate superior officer above the official reported upon shall initiate the APAR and next superior officer shall review and accept the APAR.
- The representation against entries and final grading in APAR would lie to the next superior officer above the accepting officer.
- XII. SAS Apprentice is a supervisory post and parallel could be drawn between SAS Apprentice and SO (A) /AAO.
  - APAR Formats of SAOs/AOs/AAOs may be used for writing APARs of SO (A) /SAS Apprentice.

- XIII. Since the responsibility of scrutiny and maintenance of APAR continues to vest in AN Sections of Main office, they should ensure that the full APAR including the overall grade and assessment of integrity shall be communicated to the concerned officer after the Report is complete. He shall be given the opportunity to make any representation against the entries and final grading in APAR, within fifteen days from the date of receipt of the entries in the APAR. While communicating the entries, it shall be made clear that in case no representation is received within the fifteen days, it shall be deemed that he/she has no representation to make and the APAR will be treated as final.
  - Further, if an employee is to be considered for promotion in a future DPC and his ACRs prior to the period 2008-09, which would be reckonable for assessment of his fitness in such future DPCs contain final grading which are below benchmark for his next promotion, before such ACRs are placed before the DPC, the concerned employee will be given a copy of the relevant ACR for his representation, if any and such representation will be considered by the competent authority, and pass order on said representation.
  - The AN sections of Main Office shall continue to be responsible for obtaining remarks of the Reporting, Reviewing and Accepting officers on the representations preferred against the entries and final grading in APAR and process them for consideration by the designated officer as per the statement enclosed.
  - The decision on representation may be taken objectively in a quasijudicial manner on the basis of material placed before it, after taking
    into account the views of the concerned Reporting/ reviewing Officers,
    if they are still in service. The competent authority after due
    consideration may reject the representation or may accept and modify
    the APAR accordingly. In case of up-gradation of the final grading
    given in the APAR, specific reasons therefor may also be given in the
    order of the competent authority.
  - In case the representation against entries/grading in APAR is to be considered in this Hqrs office, it may be ensured that all relevant documents (e.g. copies of APAR, comments of Reporting/ Reviewing/ Accepting officer etc.) may invariably be enclosed with the representation.
    - (DOPT OM No. 21011/1/2010-Estt.A (Pt-II) dated 14.05.2009 and No. 21011/1/2010-Estt.A dated 13.04.2010 refers)
- XIV. All the Govt. orders/instructions on preparation, maintenance and completion of APAR issued from time to time shall continue to be followed.

3. Consequent on introduction of APAR, the following proposed statements A to D containing system of reporting, reviewing, accepting and consideration of representation against the entries and final grading in APAR has been prepared, which requires considered views /suggestions of all the concerned Controller's offices.

Statement A Controller General of Defence Accounts
 Statement B Principal Controller of Defence Accounts/ Controller of Defence Accounts
 Statement C Principal Controller of Accounts (Factories) /Controller of Finance & Accounts (Factories)
 Statement D Principal Integrated Financial Advisors/ Integrated Financial Advisors

These statements along with relevant DOPT OMs and Hqrs Circulars are placed on the website and may be downloaded for perusal and forwarding considered views of your office.

- 4. Apart from above, this Hqrs office has received number of queries/doubts from different Controller's offices, which also require considered views /suggestions of all the Controller's offices to arrive at a consensus in the matter.
- a. Group C includes Supervisor (Accounts), whether Supervisor (Accounts) may initiate APAR of his subordinate and reviewed by next higher authority.
- b. In terms of Para 193 of OM Part-I, no report need be written in respect of Sr. Auditor/Auditor/Clerk/Typist/DEO/Stenographer/Canteen employee, who has not served for a minimum period of one year on the date on which it is written (viz. 31<sup>st</sup> March of the Year concerned) Whether report of SAS Apprentice may be initiated or he may initiate APAR of his subordinate in case he has not served for a minimum period of one year on the date on which it is written.
- c. Whether numerical grading in separate column provided for irregularity/punctuality in attendance in the APAR may be filled as per assessment by reporting and reviewing officers only or as per the existing provisions the Accepting Officer may exercise its discretion and award overall grading accordingly in terms of Para 215,OM Part-I and No. AN/XIII/13128(652)/Vol.XI/Amend OM-I dated 10.01.2006.
- d. As per the provision contained in DOPT OM dated 14.05.2009 and 13.04.2010, the concerned officer shall be given an opportunity to make representation against the entries and final grading in APAR. There is no mention of consideration of Appeal against rejection of

such representation in recent guidelines issued by the DOPT. Whether appeal against rejection of such representation should lie to next higher authority or not, in terms of DP & AR OM No. 21011/1/77-Estt dated 30.01.1978.

5. In view of the forgoing, it is requested that modification/comments/ suggestions on the issues and statements stated above and any other issues related to APAR, if any may be forwarded to this Hqrs office by 28<sup>nd</sup> June' 2013, so that the guidelines on APAR may be finalized.

Please acknowledge receipt.

RKKARMA
(R K Karna)

Jt. CGDA (Admin)

# No. AN/XIII/13128/APAR/2010-11 SYSTEM OF WRITING OF ANNUAL PERFORMANCE ASSESMENT REPORT (APARs) Statement --B PRINCIPAL CONTROLLER OF DEFENCE ACCOUNTS/ CONTROLLER OF DEFENCE ACCOUNTS

SI.	Category/ Officials reported upon	Reporting officer	Reviewing officer	Accepting officer	CA to consider representation against entries and final grading in APAR
	1	2	3	4	2
	MTS and Group 'C' except SO (A)	SO (A)/AAO	AO/ SAO		JCDA/ Addl. CDA or CDA/Pr. CDA as the case may be, immediately superior to Accepting Officer is in Main Office or Zonal Office)
	SO (A)/AAO	AO/SAO/ACDA/ DCDA (whosoever is immediate superior of SO (A)/AAO)	ACDA/DCDA/JCDA/ Addl. CDA whosoever is the immediate superior to the Reporting Officer	JCDA/Addl.CDA/CDA/Pr. CDA whosoever is immediately superior to the Reviewing Officer  *( for pension office) Pr.CDA/CDA if the CR was reviewed by JCDA/Addl.CDA or there is no JCDA/Addl. CDA above ACDA/DCDA	
	AO/SAO	ACDA DCDA/JCDA/	JCDA/Addl. CDA/ CDA/ Pr. CDA who is the immediate superior to the Reporting Officer	C.D.A./Pr. CDA	Pr.CDA/ Addl.CGDA  * for pension office Pr. CDA/Addl. CGDA

# No. AN/XIII/13128/APAR/2010-11

.05.2013

29

Dated

# Note:-

- himself may initiate the report as a Reporting Officer, provided the Reviewing Officer has been the same for the entire period of report and he has in a position to fill in columns to be filled in by the Reporting Officer. Where a report is thus initiated by the Reviewing Officer, it will have to be submitted by him to his own superior for review if there is a superior officer to him. (Auth:-GOI, Dept of Per. & Trg, OM No. 21011/8/85-Estt.(A), dated 23-9-1985) period of report there is no Reporting Officer with the requisite experience to initiate the report, the Reviewing Officer ξ Where ⊣
- ensured that whatever a level is missing the system is rendered into 2 tier in place of 3 tier and under no circumstances rted into multi-tier system. (Auth:- Para 217 of Office Manual Part I) conve It is to be it is 7
- when a level is missing the system the immediate superior officer above the official reported upon shall initiate the APAR and next superior officer shall review and accept the APAR In general 3
- would lie to the next superior officer above the accepting officer. The representation against entries and final grading in APAR 4
- by next higher and reviewed also includes Supervisor (Accounts). Supervisor (Acc) may initiate APAR of his subordinate authority Group C S

# (APARs) ANNUAL PERFORMANCE ASSESMENT REPORT Statement - C M OF WRITING OF

PRINC	IPAL CONTROLLER	OF ACCOUNTS (FACTO	ORIES//CONTROLLER O	F FINANCE AND ACCO	STINE
SI.	Category/ Officials reported upon		viewing officer	Accepting officer	a it is
			3	4	2
	TS and Group '(xcept SO (A)	<b>Q</b>	AO/ SAO	ACA or ACFA/ DCA or DCFA (Fys) / Addl. C of FA (Fys) whosoever is immediate superior to the Reviewing Officer	JCA or JCFA /Addl. C of FA A (Fys) or Addl. C of FA or CF&A (Fys)/C of A (Fys.)/Pr. C of A (Fys.) as the case may be, who is the immediate superior to Accepting Officer is (whether such officer is in Main Office or Zonal Office or sub office)
	SO (A)/AAO	AO/SAO/ACA/ACFA/DC A/DCFA (whosoever is immediate superior of SO (A) / AAO)	ACA or ACFA /DCA or DCFA / JCA or JCFA (Fys) /Addl.CA or Addl. CFA (Fys) who is the immediate superior to the Reporting Officer	An officer immediately superior to the Reviewing Officer (i.e. JCA or JCFA (Fys) (Addl.CA or Addl. CFA (Fys) in case the CR was reviewed by JCA or JCFA (Fys) / Addl.CA or Addl. CFA or JCFA (Fys)/ Addl.CA or JCFA (Fys)/ Addl.CFA or JCFA (Fys)/	An officer who is the immediate superior to the Accepting Officer i.e. CFA (Fys) or C of A (Fys.) or or Pr. C of A (Fys.) / Addl. CGDA

Contd...PT(

# OF WRITING OF ANNUAL PERFORMANCE ASSESMENT REPORT (APARS)

Contd Statement - C

# (FACTORIES) CONTROLLER OF ACCOUNTS (FACTORIES)/CONTROLLER OF FINANCE AND ACCOUNTS PRINCIPAL

SI.	Category/ Officials	Reporting officer	Reviewing officer	Accepting officer	CA to consider
	reported upon				representation against
					entries and final
					grading in APAR
		2	3	4	9
III) a	AO/SAO	ACA/DCA/JCA/AddI.CA	JCA/Addl.CA or C of A	C of A (Fys)/ CIA (Fys)	Pr. C of A
		(Fys)	(Fys) whosoever is next //Pr. C of A (Fys)	r. C of A (Fys	CGDA
			higher authority to		
			Reporting Officer		
111) P	Account Office headed by an		IDAS officer namely ACFA/DCFA/JCFA/ Addl. CFA (Fys.)		
	AO/SAO	ACFA/DCFA/JCFA/ Addl. JCFA/Addl.		CFA/CFA CFA group/PCA (Fys)	Addl. CGDA
		CFA	group		
111) C	Accounts Office headed		by an Accounts Officer where CFA (Fys.) in-charge of a Group is in positior	ge of a Group is in positi	uo
	AOS/SAOs	i) ACFA/ DCFA/JCFA (Fys) group	CFA (Fys) group	CCA(fys) /CIA (Fys)	(Fys) CGDA/Addl. CGDA
		Addl. CFA in the Group		<b>€</b>	
		under CFA			
		ii) CFA Gp. where there	PCA (Fys)		
		is no ACFA/DCFA			
		/JCFA/ Addl.CFA			

Note:-

- period of requisite experience to initiate the report, the Reviewing Officer a report is thus initiated by the Officer, it will have to be submitted by him to his own superior for review if there is a superior officer to him. (Auth: of Per. & Trg, OM No. 21011/8/85-Estt.(A), dated 23-9-1985). Should be superior of stier and under no circumstar should that whatever a level is missing the system is rendered into 2 tier in place of 3 tier and under no circumstar ted into multi-tier system. (Auth:- Para 217 of Office Manual Part – I) himself may initiate the report as a Reporting Officer, provided the Reviewing Officer has been the same for the entire report and he has in a position to fill in columns to be filled in by the Reporting Officer. Where a report is thus initiatec Where for period of report there is no Reporting Officer with the GOI, Dept Reviewing  $\leftarrow$
- rendered into 2 tier in place of 3 tier and under no circumstances It is to be el it is convert 7
- superior officer above the official reported upon shall initiate the next superior officer shall review and accept the APAR In general when a level is missing the system the immediate **APAR** and  $\mathfrak{C}$
- The representation against entries and final grading in APAR would lie to the next superior officer above the accepting officer. 4
- and reviewed by next higher may initiate APAR of his subordinate also includes Supervisor (Accounts). Supervisor (A/cs) Group C authority 5

No. AN/XIII/13128/APAR/2010-11

Dated

# SYSTEM OF WRITING OF ANNUAL PERFORMANCE ASSESMENT REPORT (APARs) Statement –D PRINCIPAL INTEGRATED FINANCIAL ADVISORS/ INTEGRATED FINANCIAL ADVISORS

SI.	Category/ Officials reported upon	Reporting officer	Reviewing officer	Accepting officer	CA to consider representation against entries and final grading in APAR
			3	4	2
	ded by Pr.	IFA (HAG Level)			
	Clk/Adr/ Sr. Adr	AAO	AO/SAO	DyIFA	Jt. IFA/ Addl. IFA
	AAO	SAO	Dy IFA /Sr. Dy IFA	Jt. IFA/ Addl. IFA	PIFA
	AO/SAO	Dy. IFA./ Sr. Dy IFA	Jt. IFA/ Addl. IFA	PIFA	Addl. CGDA
m	ded by IFA	(SAG Level)			
	Clk/Adr/ Sr. Adr	AAO	AO/SAO	Dy. JFA /Sr. Dy. IFA	Jt. IFA/ Addl. IFA
	AAO	AO/SAO	Dy IFA./Sr. Dy IFA	Jt. IFA/ Addi. IFA	IFA
	AO/SAO	Dy. IFA./ Sr. Dy IFA	Jt. IFA/ Addl. IFA	IFA	Addl. CGDA
	ded by IFA	(JAG Level)			
	Clk/Adr/ Sr. Adr	AAO	AO/SAO	Dy. JFA /Sr. Dy. IFA/Jt.IFA	IFA Command
	AAO	AO/SAO	Dy IFA./Sr. Dy IFA	Jt. IFA/ Addl. IFA	IFA Command
<b>:</b>	AO/SAO	Dy. IFA./ Sr. Dy IFA	Jt. IFA/ Addl. IFA	IFA Command	Addl. CGDA
	ded by IFA	(STS/JTS Level)			
•—	Adr	90	AO/SAO	Dy. JFA /Sr. Dy. IFA/Jt.JFA/A	IFA Command
	AAO	AO/SAO	Dy IFA./Sr. Dy IFA	A Comm	Addl. CGDA
	AO/SAO	Dy. IFA./ Sr. Dy IFA	Jt. IFA/ Addl. IFA	IFA Command	Addl. CGDA
		1 1,			
	ded by IFA	(AO/SAO Level)			
•	Adr	AAO/AO	AO/SAO	IFA Command	IFA Command
	AAO	AO/SAO	Jt.IFA/Addl.IFA (Comman		Addl. CGDA
	AO/SAO	CFAwhich designated as	IFA (Command) /other	Addl.CGDA	CGDA
			3		

# No. AN/XIII/13128/APAR/2010-11 Dated

.05.2013

29

# Note:-

- period of Where for period of report there is no Reporting Officer with the requisite experience to initiate the report, the Reviewing Officer (Auth:by the a report is thus initiated himself may initiate the report as a Reporting Officer, provided the Reviewing Officer has been the same for the entire report and he has in a position to fill in columns to be filled in by the Reporting Officer. Where a report is thus initiated Reviewing Officer, it will have to be submitted by him to his own superior for review if there is a superior officer to him. GOI, Dept of Per. & Trg, OM No. 21011/8/85-Estt.(A), dated 23-9-1985)  $\vdash$
- It is to be ensured that whatever a level is missing the system is rendered into 2 tier in place of 3 tier and under no circumstances (Auth:- Para 217 of Office Manual Part - I) it is converted into multi-tier system. 7
- In general when a level is missing the system the immediate superior officer above the official reported upon shall initiate the APAR and next superior officer shall review and accept the APAR. ന
- officer. The representation against entries and final grading in APAR would lie to the next superior officer above the accepting 4
- and reviewed by next higher Group C also includes Supervisor (Accounts). Supervisor (A/cs) may initiate APAR of his subordinate authority Ŋ

CONFIDENTIAL

NO. AN/XIII/13128/3/Vol.XI Office of the C.G.D.A. West Block-V, R.K. Puram New Delhi- 66

Dated:- 14/12/90

 $T_{\mathcal{O}}$ 

All Controllers
including Chief Controllers and
Jt. CDA (Funds) Meerut

SUB:- Writing and maintenance of Confidential Reports.

175 175

REF:- This Office Confidential Circular NO. AN/XIII/13128/3/Vol.XI dt. 7.11.90.

\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*\*

The system of Reporting, Reviewing and Accepting of Confidential Reports in respect of officials of the rank of DCDA and below as envisaged in our Circular dated 7.11.90 has been examined in consultation with the Controllers and it has been decided by the CGDA to adopt it with immediate effect, with the following modifications:-

- i) Under category (i) i.e. Group 'D' and Group 'C' except SO(A), under Accepting Officer, the existing remarks may be substituted by the following Notes:-
  - NOTE (1):- In case there is no AO above Reporting Officer ( SO(A)/AAO), the next superior officer i.e. ACDA/DCDA or JCDA shall review and accept the CR.
  - NOTE (2):- In case there is no SO(A)/AAO immediately above the official concerned, the AO shall initiate the report and his immediate superior officer i.e. ACDA/DCDA or JCDA shall review and accept the CR.
- ii) The note under category (iv) i.e. ACDA/DCDA may please be amended to read as under:-

" In case the ACDA/DCDA (including IDAS probation-ers) is directly under CDA, the CDA will initiate the report and submit it to the Addl. CGDA (Inspection)/-CCDA (Pensions) as the case may be.

2. A fresh statement in-corporating the above modifications is enclosed.

. . . . . 2

It may please seen that whenever a level is missing the system is rendered into 2 Tier, in place of 3 Tier, but under no circum stances it shall be converted into a multi Ties System.

Since the responsibility of scrutiny and maintenance of CRs continues to vest in AN Sections of Main Office, they should ensure that the CRscontaining adverse remarks are scruti nised on priority basis and communicated to the concerned offical as far as possible, within one month from the date of recording agreeably to the provisions of DP WAR On NO. 51/5/72- Estt (A) dated 20.5.72 reproduced as Para 4.5 of Chapter-IV of Brochure on preparation and maintenance of Confidential Reports circulated under this office Confidential NO. AN/XIII/13128/Vol. XI dt. 27.9.89. While communicating the adverse remarks, the concerned official shall be specifically informed of the officer to whom the representation against adverse remarks lies and also told to prefer the representation within one month from the date of receipt of CR containing adverse remarks, it so desired. The AN sections of Main Office shall continue to be responsible for obtaining remarks of the Reporting, Reviewing and Acception Of Guers on where presentations against adverse remarks and process them for consideration by the designated officer as per the statement enclosed.

In case any of the officials prefers an appeal against rejection of representation, within six months from the date of rejection of the representation, it shall be considered by an officer as per the statement enclosed, irrespective of to whom such appeal is addressed. No further petition/appeal lies in terms of DP&AR OM NO. 21011/1/77-Estt(A) dated 30.1.76 reproduced at Para 4.10 of Brochure on preparation and Maintenance of Confidential Reports.

- All the Govt. orders/instructions on preparation and maintenance of Confidential Reports issued from time to time shall continue to be followed.
- 7. Please acknowledge receipt.

可以出土的人的

Capy to:-

(R.K.CHAWLA)
Addl.CGDA (AN)

ANINE	Section Iocal	Ĭ	
AN/II	-dc-	Ĭ	for information and guid-
AN/IV	-do-	I	ance.
AN/XI	-do-	Ĭ	
AN/XII	-do-	Ĭ	
		Ĭ	一加、ろい、一つつ
			(M.SIMON JOHN)

A.A.O (AN)

Category	Reporting officer	Reviewing offi-	ccepting officer	competent authority.  consider representation against acverse remarks	"Cômpetent authority to consider appeal against rejection of earlier repre- sentation.
1) Group Group Zxcept 50(A)		3	ACDA/DCDA/JCDA whoever is immediate superior to the Reviewing Officer.	jcba or cba as the case may be, immedately superior to Accepting Officer whether such officerice is in Main Officerice or Zonal Officerus by office)	An officer immediately superior to the Officer referred to in Column 5 i.e. CDA or Addl. CGDA (Inspection.)
Note:-a)	In case there is no ACC or Jt. CDA shall Revi	above Reporting O	Éficer (SO(A)/AAO), th	enext supe	er i.e. ACDA/DCDA
( q	In case there is no 30 Report and his immedia	(A) cr AbC immedia te superior office	ely above the officta shall Review and Acc	pt the	initiate
II) SO(A)/	AO/ACDA/DCD. (whoever is infinediate superior of SO(A)/AAO)	ACDA/DCDA/JCDA  - whoever is the immediate super- ior to the Rep- orting Officer.	An Officer immediate ately superior to the Reviewing Offi- CDA in case the CR Was reviewed by JCDA or there is no JCDA above ACDA/DCDA)	ately superior to the Accepting Off- icer, i.e. CDA or Addl. CGDA (In spe- ction)	intely superior to the officer referred to in Column 5 i.e. Addl. CGDA (Inspection) or CGDA
III) À. 0.	ACDA/DCDA	JCDE. who is the immedia superior to the Reporting Officer.	C. D. A.	Addl.C.G.D.A.	C.G.D.A.
Note:-	In case the 30 is dir inftiate the CR and s	submit in to his immessentition adainst ad	ewing Officer (JCDA), diate superior (CDA), verse remarks and to	, the Reviewing Officer that for Review and Acceptance. e appeal against rejection	r chall ance. In tion of

 $\odot$ 

• ()

(Inspection probatior. ACDA/

 $\Lambda I$ 

s probationers) the Addl. CGDA

Note:-

petent ty to reject lisr r	r on	Accounts Offi- whoever is imm- the case may be who diately superior cer ediate superior is the immediate to the officer retorned to the Reviewing superior to ferred to in Col.5 officer.  Cer (whether such or Chief'C. of Accepting Offi- officer is in Main (Fys).  Office or sub- office).
category Reporting	1	roup 'D' &

officer superior the (À)/ e E the Accept and Review Reporti shall above no Jt /DCA ACA

shall the 94. Accept the concerned, eview and official ser shall the of: above ately S((A)/AAO immediat report no <del>ب</del> د case there

offi super i mmediately supe ior to the of cer referred in Col. 5 i.e Chief C of A or CGDA Officer An or (Fys) fficer who is inmediate su-1. B. perior to 'Ac ing Officer' C of A (fys) Chief C of A Officer An Of the was reviewed by the Jra super.

An Officer 14.
ediately superior to the Reviro Officer ther JCA OI ewing O. (JCA Or in case no was stperior to the Reporting "CA/DCA/JCA inimed ate Officer. sulp immediate su rior to the SO(A)/AAO /DC: <del>بر</del> ن AO/ACA/I whoever

) ACDIVEDA including IDAS probationers.

iv

Note:

• (7)

superior In ca Offic his in Revi



# CHIEF CONTROLLER OF DEFENCE ACCOUNTS (PEWSIONS)

	Categor		Reporting Offi-	Reviewing Offi- CCr	Accepting Offi-	competent authority to consider repre- sentation against adverse remarks.	. Competent auth- ority to consi- der appeal aga- in st rejection of earlier re- presentation.
	i) Group & Group & Group SO(A)		SO (E) / EAO	Accounts Officer.	ACDA/DCDA/JCDA whoever is immediately superior to the Reviewing Officer.	JCDA or CDA as the case maybe immediately superior to the 'Accepting Officer'.	An Officer immediately superior to the Officer correct correction col. 5 i.e. CDA or Chief CDA.
	Mote:- (a)	υŢ. (	n case there is no	Cabov. Report States	Officer (SO(A)/A30)	, tra next superior of	ficer i.e
	<u>Q</u>	<u> </u>	n case thire is no nitiate the repor	o SC(A) or AAO t and his immed	immediately above the offi	cial concerned, the Adamst the	shall e CR.
	ii) SO(A)/	ÀÃO	ACDIV DCDA	acoa/ocoa/scoa whoever is the immediate super- ior to the Repor- ting Officer.	An Officer immediate ately superior to the Reviewing Officer CDA if the CR was Reviewed by JCDA or there is no JCDA above ACDA/DCDA	An Officer immediately superior to to the 'Accepting Officer' i.e. CDA or Chief C.D.A.	in Officer immed- intely superior t the officer refe- rred to in Col.5 i.e. Chief CDA or C.G.D.A.
	111) 10.		ACDA/DCDA	J.CD.	CDA or Chief CDA as the case may be, immediately supgrior to the Reviewing Officer.	chicf CD2/CGDA	CGDA/FA (DS)
•	Note:-	In ca the r such	ase the NO is dire report and submit cases, the repre resentation would	ectly under the Revi it to his immediate sentation again st ad lie to next superio	cwing of superion verse ref r office	the Reviewing Officer CDA) for Review and Ac appeal against reject	shall initiate ceptance. In ion of first

₹<u>.</u>

\

		LN
		EMENT

Category 1	Reporting Offi-	Reriewing Offi-	Accepting Offi- cer	Concetent authority to onsider repre- sentation against advarse remarks.	Competent autionatity to consider appeal against rejection of earlier representation.
Group 'C' Group 'D' cept 30(3)	X X So(:,)/:,odo	AC, 'ACGDA	ACGD. DY. CGD. Addl. CGD. Addl. CGD. who is immediately superior to the Reviewing Officer)		An Officer immediately superior to the officer referred to in Col.5.

inmediatel erior offic superi or ate ) 30(∴) immeči Not

An Officer immediately superior to the officer referred to in Col.5.
ar officer immedi- etaly superior to the Accepting Offi- car.
Addl. CGD.
LY. CGDA
AO/ACGDA
11) SO(A)/rAO

In NC

(FA(DS) CGDA (FA(DS)	F. (DS)	FA (D3)	E. (D.S.)
G.G.D.n. Addl.C3D.(AT/Insp)	C.C.D.A.	C. G. D	.α.Ω.Ω
OY.CGDA(MW, AT Addl.CGDA (AM) In spection Addl.CGDA (EDPs) SDPs)	Addl. Caba (AND Addl. Caba (An)	add.con (Edps) addl.con (ar/Insp)	Addl.cGDA (TT/ Addl.cGDA (TT/Insp)
iii)(a) A.O. RGGA(AN, AT, Inspection, EDPs)	b) 7.0. (i) DY. GGDA (7.N)	(ii) DY. CGDA (ELPs)	(iii) DY. CGDA (AT/Insp)

If i Offi

C3

Adal ------

FA(D

CBDA

S

# No. 21011/1/2005-Estt (A) (Pt-II) Government of India Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances and Pensions (Department of Personnel and Training)

North Block, New Delhi, 14<sup>th</sup> May, 2009

# OFFICE MEMORANDUM

Subject:- Maintenance and preparation of Annual Performance Appraisal Reportscommunication of all entries for fairness and transparency in public administration.

The undersigned is directed to invite the attention of the Ministries/Departments to the existing provisions in regard to preparation and maintenance of Annual Confidential Reports which inter-alia provide that only adverse remarks should be communicated to the officer reported upon for representation, if any. The Supreme Court has held in their judgement dated 12.5.2008 in the case of Dev Dutt vs Union of India (Civil Appeal No.7631 of 2002) that the object of writing the confidential report and making entries is to give an opportunity to the public servant to improve the performance. The 2<sup>nd</sup> Administrative Reforms Commission in their 10<sup>th</sup> Report has also recommended that the performance appraisal system for all services be made more consultative and transparent on the lines of the PAR of the All India Services.

- 2. Keeping in view the above position, the matter regarding communication of entries in the ACRs in the case of civil services under the Government of India has been further reviewed and the undersigned is directed to convey the following decisions of the Government:-
  - (i) The existing nomenclature of the Annual Confidential Report will be modified as Annual Performance Assessment Report (APAR).
  - (ii) The full APAR including the overall grade and assessment of integrity shall be communicated to the concerned officer after the Report is complete with the remarks of the Reviewing Officer and the Accepting Authority wherever such system is in vogue. Where Government servant has only one supervisory level above him as in the case of personal staff attached to officers, such communication shall be made after the reporting officer has completed the performance assessment.
  - (iii) The Section entrusted with the maintenance of APARs after its receipt shall disclose the same to the officer reported upon.
  - (iv) The concerned officer shall be given the opportunity to make any representation against the entries and the final grading given in the Report within a period of fifteen days from the date of receipt of the entries in the APAR. The representation shall be restricted to the specific factual observations contained in the report leading to assessment of the officer in terms of attributes, work output etc. While communicating the entries, it shall be made clear that in case no representation is received within the fifteen days, it shall be deemed that he/she has no representation to make. If the concerned APAR Section does not receive any information from the concerned officer on or before fifteen days from the date of disclosure, the APAR will be treated as final.

- (v) The new system of communicating the entries in the APAR shall be made applicable prospectively only with effect from the reporting period 2008-09 which is to be initiated after 1<sup>st</sup> April 2009.
- (vi) The competent authority for considering adverse remarks under the existing instructions may consider the representation, if necessary, in consultation with the reporting and/or reviewing officer and shall decide the matter objectively based on the material placed before him within a period of thirty days from the date of receipt of the representation.
- (vii) The competent authority after due consideration may reject the representation or may accept and modify the APAR accordingly. The decision of the competent authority and the final grading shall be communicated to the officer reported upon within fifteen days of receipt of the decision of the competent authority by the concerned APAR Section.
- 3. All Ministries/Departments are requested to bring to the notice of all the offices under them for strict implementation of the above instructions.

(C.A. Subramanian)

Director

To

# All Ministries/Departments of Government of India

# Copy to:-

- 1. Chief Secretaries of All State Governments/U.T.s
- 2. The President's Secretariat, New Delhi.
- 3. The Prime Minister's Office, New Delhi.
- 4. The Cabinet Secretariat, New Delhi.
- 5. The Rajya Sabha Secretariat.
- 6. The Lok Sabha Secretariat.
- 7. The Comptroller and Auditor General of India, New Delhi.
- 8. The Union Public Service Commission, New Delhi.

# Copy also to:-

- (a) All Attached offices under the Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances and Pensions.
- (b) Establishment Officer and Secretary, ACC (10 copies).
- (c) All officers and Sections in the Department of Personnel and Training.
- (d) Secretary, Staff Side, National Council (JCM), 13-C, Ferozeshah Road, New Delhi.
- (e) All Staff Members of Departmental Council (JCM).
- (f) All Staff members of the Departmental Council (JCM), Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances and Pensions.
- (g) NIC (DoP&T) for placing the Office Memorandum on the web-site of DoP&T.
- (h) Hindi Section for Hindi version of the O.M.

# No. 21011/1/2010-Estt.A Government of India Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances & Pensions Department of Personnel & Training

North Block, New Delhi Dated the 13th April, 2010

# OFFICE MEMORANDUM

Subject: Below Benchmark gradings in ACRs prior to the reporting period 2008-09 and objective consideration of representation by the competent authority against remarks in the APAR or for upgradation of the final grading.

The undersigned is directed to say that prior to the reporting period 2008-09, only the adverse remarks in the ACRs had to be communicated to the concerned officer for representation, if any to be considered by the competent authority. The question of treating the grading in the ACR which is below the benchmark for next promotion has been considered in this Department and it has been decided that if an employee is to be considered for promotion in a future DPC and his ACRs prior to the period 2008-09 which would be reckonable for assessment of his fitness in such future DPCs contain final grading which are below the benchmark for his next promotion, before such ACRs are placed before the DPC, the concerned employee will be given a copy of the relevant ACR for his representation, if any, within 15 days of such communication. It may be noted that only below benchmark ACR for the period relevant to promotion need be sent. There is no need to send below benchmark ACRs of other years.

- 2. As per existing instructions, representations against the remarks or for upgradation of the final grading given in the APAR (previously known as ACR) should be examined by the competent authority in consultation, if necessary, with the Reporting and the Reviewing Officer, if any. While considering the representation, the competent authority decides the matter objectively in a quasi-judicial manner on the basis of material placed before it. This would imply that the competent authority shall take into account the contentions of the officer who has represented against the particular remarks/grading in the APAR and the views of the Reporting and Reviewing officer if they are still in service on the points raised in the representation vis-a-vis the remarks/gradings given by them in the APAR. The UPSC has informed this Department that the Commission has observed that while deciding such representations, the competent authorities sometimes do not take into account the views of Reporting/Reviewing Officers if they are still in service. The Commission has further observed that in a majority of such cases, the competent authority does not give specific reasons for upgrading the below benchmark ACR/APAR gradings at par with the benchmark for next promotion.
- 3. All Ministries/Departments are therefore requested to inform the competent authorities while forwarding such cases to them to decide on the representations against the remarks or for upgradation of the grading in the APAR that the decision on the representation may be taken objectively after taking into account the views of the concerned Reporting/Reviewing Officers if they are still in service and in case of upgradation of the final grading given in the APAR, specific reasons therefor may also be given in the order of the competent authority.

(C.A. Subramanian)
Director

To

# Copy to:-

- The President's Secretariat, New Delhi.
  The Prime Minister's Office, New Delhi.
  The Cabinet Secretariat, New Delhi.
  The Rajya Sabha Secretariat.
  The Lok Sabha Secretariat.
  The Lok Sabha Secretariat.
  The Lok Sabha Secretariat.
  The Union Public Service Commission, New Delhi. ← 20 m 4 m 6 m 7

# Copy also to:-

- of Personnel, Public Grievances and Pensions. All Attached offices under the Ministry of Personnel, Pu Establishment Officer and Secretary, ACC (10 copies).
- All officers and Sections in the Department of Personnel and Training.

  NIC (DoP&T) for placing the Office Memorandum on the web-site of DoP&T

  Hindi Section for Hindi version of the O.M.  $\mathbb{S}\mathbb{E}\mathbb{E}$

# No. 21011/1/2005-Estt (A) (Pt-II) Government of India Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances and Pensions (Department of Personnel and Training)

North Block, New Delhi, 23<sup>rd</sup> July, 2009

# OFFICE MEMORANDUM

Subject:- Preparation and maintenance of Annual Performance Assessment Reports (APAR).

The undersigned is directed to invite the attention of the Ministries/Departments to the instructions contained in this Department's O.M. No. No. 21011/02/2009-Estt.(A) 16/02/2009 and O.M. of even umber dated 14.05.2009 on the subjects of timely preparation and proper maintenance of APAR and making the APAR transparent for representation for upgradation, if any, by the officer reported upon. The matter of preparation and maintenance of APAR has been further reviewed in this Department keeping in view the system in this regard in respect of All India Services (AIS) and the undersigned is directed to convey the following decisions:-

- (i) All cadre authorities shall include a box in the APAR for reflecting by the reporting officer the pen picture of the officer reported upon where the reporting officer will be required to indicate his comments on the overall qualities of the officer including areas of strengths and lesser strength and his attitude towards the weaker sections. A column will also be added in the section relating to the reviewing authority for giving the reviewing authority's remarks on the pen picture reflected by the reporting officer. There will be no other separate column in the APAR for overall assessment apart from the pen picture.
- (ii) A provision may be made in the APAR in the relevant section for remarks by the reviewing officer to indicate specifically the differences, if any, with the assessment made by the reporting officer, and the reasons therefor.
- (iii) Numerical grading are to be awarded by reporting and reviewing authorities for the quality of work output, personal attributes and functional competence of the officer reported upon. These should be on a scale of 1-10, where 1 refers to the lowest grade and 10 to the highest. The guidelines given in Annexure-I shall be kept in mind while awarding numerical gradings.
- (iv) The format for the purpose of numerical grading in the three areas of work output, assessment of personal attributes and assessment of functional competency is in Annexure-II. For Group 'B' and 'C' officials however, suitable changes may be made by the concerned cadre authorities in the items of assessment as per functional requirements of the job and the next promotional post for them. The overall grade on a score of 1-10 will be based on 40% weightage on assessment of work output, and 30% each for assessment of personal attributes and functional competency. The overall grading will be based on addition of the mean value of each group of indicators in proportion to weightage assigned.

- (v) Wherever 'accepting authority' has been prescribed in the existing system in the cadre, columns may also be provided for such authority to give his comments on the remarks of the reporting/reviewing authority and details of difference of opinion, if any, with reasons for the same. In such cases, the accepting authority will also give overall grade on a score of 1-10.
- (vi) A schedule for completion of all activities relating to the APAR is given in Annexure-III.
- 2. The above provisions would be applicable for the APAR from the reporting year 2009-10 onwards. The concerned authorities may accordingly make necessary changes in the APAR format for numerical grading to be given by reporting and reviewing officer. This O.M. does not in any way affect the part to be filled in by the officer reported upon and other existing columns in the APAR format like attitude towards SC/ST/OBC, relations with public (wherever applicable), integrity, training requirement etc. for descriptive remarks.
- 3. All Ministries/Departments are requested to bring to the notice of all the offices under them for strict implementation of the above instructions.

(C.A. Subramanian)

Director

To

# All Ministries/Departments of Government of India

## Copy to:-

- 1. Chief Secretaries of All State Governments/U.T.s
- 2. The President's Secretariat, New Delhi.
- 3. The Prime Minister's Office, New Delhi.
- 4. The Cabinet Secretariat, New Delhi.
- 5. The Rajya Sabha Secretariat.
- 6. The Lok Sabha Secretariat.
- 7. The Comptroller and Auditor General of India, New Delhi.
- 8. The Union Public Service Commission, New Delhi.

### Copy also to:-

- (i) All Attached offices under the Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances and Pensions.
- (ii) Establishment Officer and Secretary, ACC (10 copies).
- (iii) All officers and Sections in the Department of Personnel and Training.
- (iv) Secretary, Staff Side, National Council (JCM), 13-C, Ferozeshah Road, New Delhi.
- (v) All Staff Members of Departmental Council (JCM).
- (vi) All Staff members of the Departmental Council (JCM), Ministry of Personnel, Public Grievances and Pensions.
- (vii) NIC (DoP&T) for placing the Office Memorandum on the web-site of DoP&T

# Annexure-I

# Guidelines regarding filling up of APAR with numerical grading

- (i) The columns in the APAR should be filled with due care and attention and after devoting adequate time.
- (ii) It is expected that any grading of 1 or 2 (against work output or attributes or overall grade) would be adequately justified in the pen-picture by way of specific failures and similarly, any grade of 9 or 10 would be justified with respect to specific accomplishments. Grades of 1-2 or 9-10 are expected to be rare occurrences and hence the need to justify them. In awarding a numerical grade the reporting and reviewing authorities should rate the officer against a larger population of his/her peers that may be currently working under them.
- (iii)APARs graded between 8 and 10 will be rated as 'outstanding' and will be given a score of 9 for the purpose of calculating average scores for empanelment/promotion.
- (iv)APARs graded between 6 and short of 8 will be rated as 'very good' and will be given a score of 7.
- (v) APARs graded between 4 and 6 short of 6 will be rated as 'good' and given a score of 5.
- (vi)APARs graded below 4 will be given a score of zero.

### Annexure II

### Assessment of work output (weightage to this Section would be 40%)

	Reporting Authority	Reviewing Authority	Initial of Reviewing Authority
i)Accomplishment of planned work/work allotted as per subjects allotted			
ii) Quality of output			
iii) Analytical ability	<u>.</u>		
(iv)Accomplishment of exceptional work / unforeseen tasks performed		-	
Overall Grading on 'Work Output'			

### Assessment of personal attributes (weightage to this Section would be 30%)

	Reporting Authority	Reviewing Authority	Initial of Reviewing Authority
i) Attitude to work		<del>†</del>	
ii) Sense of responsibility			
iii) Maintenance of Discipline			
iv) Communication skills			
v) Leadership qualities			
vi) Capacity to work in team spirit			
vii) Capacity to work in time limit			
viii) Inter-personal relations			
Overall Grading on personal attributes			

EsttE/ACR matters

# Assessment of functional competency (weightage to this Section would be 30%)

	Reporting Authority	Reviewing Authority	Initial of Reviewing Authority
i) Knowledge of Rules / Regulations / Procedures in the area of function and ability to apply them correctly.			
ii) Strategic planning ability			
iii) Decision making ability			
iv) Coordination ability			
v) Ability to motivate and develop subordinates			
Overall Grading on functional competency			

# Annexure II

# Assessment of work output (weightage to this Section would be 40%)

	Reporting	Reviewing	Initial of Devicesing
	/ Automory	Authority	Authority
i)Accomplishment of planned work/work allotted as per subjects allotted			
ii) Quality of output			
iii) Analytical ability			
(iv)Accomplishment of exceptional work / unforeseen tasks performed	•		
Overall Grading on 'Work Output'			

# Assessment of personal attributes (weightage to this Section would be 30%)

	[			
	Reporting	Reviewing	Initial of	
	Authority	Authority	Reviewing	
			Authority	
i) Attitude to work				> <u>\</u>
ii) Sense of responsibility				
iii) Maintenance of Discipline				3
iv) Communication skills				
v) Leadership qualities				
vi) Capacity to work in team spirit				
vii) Capacity to work in time limit			•	
viii) Inter-personal relations				
Overall Grading on personal attributes				

EsttE/ACR matters

# Assessment of functional competency (weightage to this Section would be 30%)

	Reporting Authority	Reviewing Authority	Initial of Reviewing Authority
i) Knowledge of Rules / Regulations /Procedures in the area of function and ability to apply them correctly.			
ii) Strategic planning ability			
iii) Decision making ability			
iv) Coordination ability			
v) Ability to motivate and develop subordinates		•	
Overall Grading on functional competency			

Budgeton a service standard to

# Time schedule for preparation/completion of APAR (Reporting year- Financial year)

S.No.	Activity	Date by which to be completed
1.	Distribution of blank APAR	
	forms to all concerned (i.e., to officer to be reported upon where self-appraisal has to be given and to reporting officers where self-appraisal is not to be given)	
2.	Submission of self-appraisal to reporting officer by officer to be reported upon (where applicable).	<u> </u>
3.	Submission of report by reporting officer to reviewing officer	30 <sup>th</sup> June
4.	Report to be completed by Reviewing Officer and to be sent to Administration or CR Section/Cell or accepting authority, wherever provided.	1
5.	Appraisal by accepting authority, wherever provided	31 <sup>st</sup> August
6.	(a) Disclosure to the officer reported upon where there is no accepting authority	01 <sup>st</sup> September
	(b) Disclosure to the officer reported upon where there is accepting authority	15 <sup>th</sup> September
7.	Receipt of representation, if any, on APAR	15 days from the date of receipt of communication
8.	Forwarding of representations to the competent authority	
	(a) where there is no accepting authority for APAR	21 <sup>st</sup> September
	(a) where there is accepting authority for APAR	06 <sup>th</sup> October
9.	Disposal of representation by the competent authority	Within one month from the date of receipt of representation.
10.	Communication of the decision of the competent authority on the representation by the APAR Cell	15 <sup>th</sup> November
11.	End of entire APAR process, after which the APAR will be finally taken on record	

# CONFIDENTIAL

No.AN/XIII/13128/(652)/Vol. XI/Amend OM-I Office of the C.G.D.A, West Block-V, R.K. Puram, New Delhi-66.

Dated: 10.01.2006.

To

- (i) All the Pr. Controllers /Pr. IFA
- (ii) All the Controllers / IFAs

Subject:

Proposal to amend para 215 of the Office Manual Part-I in regard to criteria for assessing irregularity in attendance.

Reference:

- (i) HQrs Confidential circular No.AN/XIII/13128/3/Vol.XI dated 24.06.1992.
- (ii) HQrs Confidential circular of even No. dated 25.08.2005.

It may be recalled that the views of all the Pr. Controllers/Controllers have been called for in the context of amending the existing provisions of Para 215 of Office Manual Part-I in regard to criteria for assessing irregularity in attendance, vide this HQrs confidential circular dated 25.08.2005 cited under reference.

- 2. The matter was examined and after taking into account the views expressed by Pr. Controllers / Controllers, it has been observed by the CGDA that the existing provisions of para 215 of the Office Manual Part-I can be used to good effect to improve the regularity in attendance by all the Pr. Controllers / Controllers without making any changes thereto and has desired that the provisions of para 215 may be brought to the notice of all the Pr. Controllers / Controllers.
- 3. Accordingly, the contents of this HQrs circular No. AN/XIII/13128/3/Vol.XI dated 24.06.1992 are reiterated, in accordance with which," the leave sanctioning authorities while according ex-post-facto sanction for any kind of leave other than on medical grounds/CL, will place on record that though the absence was being regularized by grant of leave to avoid hardship to the applicant, his action had not been appreciated as it had resulted in dislocation of work. Such orders of the leave sanctioning authority will be required to be communicated in writing to the employee concerned. Thus while such orders of the leave sanctioning authority do not necessarily call for initiation of formal disciplinary action, nevertheless they could be reflected in the ACRs as adverse".

- 4. Further, in terms of Para 2 (ii) of this HQrs circular dated 24.06.1992 the accepting officer has been allowed to exercise discretion whether to treat the ACR as adverse or other wise on account of irregularity in attendance. Before exercising their discretion judiciously, the Accepting Officer in consultation with establishment section, should thoroughly go into the circumstances leading to post sanctioned leave and if he is satisfied with the genuineness of the circumstances, he may treat the ACR as clear duly recording the reasons, not withstanding that the Govt. servant availed post sanctioned leave on private affairs over and above the spells stipulated under Para 215 of the Office Manual Part-I.
- 5. It is requested that these instructions may be brought to the notice of all concerned ie. leave sanctioning authorities and Accepting Officers for their guidance and compliance.

(Arvind Kadyan)

Dy. Controller General (Admin.)

# Copy to:

- i) AN-I Section Local for information.
- ii) AN-IV Section Local for information and necessary action.
- iii) AN-VI Library.
- iv) Guard file.

(Arvind Kadyan)

Dy. Controller General (Admin.)